Analysis of Achievement of Universal Primary Education in Attaining Millennium Development Goals in Pakistan

Sammiya Hanif
MPhil Scholar Department of Education, Women University of AJ&K Bagh
E.mail: sammiyahanif@gmail.com

Dr Muhammad Mushtaq
Associate professor, Department of Education Women University of AJ&K Bagh
Email: dr.muhammad.mushtaq@wuajk.edu.pk

Dr Muhammad Asghar Ali
Assistant Professor, Department of Education Women University of AJ&K Bagh
Email: aamasgharali@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Pakistan education has faced many bottlenecks that include low enrollment rate and high dropout rate. The education system is discriminatory and inconsistent. This study aims to analyze the Pakistan's achievement of universal primary education in attaining Millennium Development Goals. The study settled on 4 indicators and collected relevant indicator data from 2016 till 2021 by document review method using checklist (has all the indicators measuring universal primary education) as a research tool. According to analysis Pakistan's performance related to MDG-2 is not up to the mark. The primary education is neglected, poorly financed and mismanaged. In this backdrop the study critically explored the lack of government commitment for universal primary education. On the basis of this study it is recommended that for the universalization of Primary Education government should take all private schools in its own custody to discourage the business in education and promote one level of education ignoring the discrimination of class, set incentives for poor parents to overcome dropout rate at primary level, involve Deni Madaris in achievement universal primary education, concentrate on pre-primary and apply some other feasible strategies to enhance enrollment by awareness programs like workshops, seminars, stage drama, theaters that encourage the parents and children for education. Government need to enforce education emergency to cope with the matter otherwise we will not be able to achieve the true education and peaceful society.
Key words: Pre-primary Education, MDGs, UPE, Enrollment, Dropout rate

INTRODUCTION
The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) were established at the Millennium Summit of the United Nations (United Nations, 2000). It was a milestone in the history of United Nations when 189 member states and 23 International Organizations adopted charter (Shaukat et al., 2017). It is determined as the pact of century built for international development where the leaders all over the world identified specific development preferences across worldwide issues, The worldwide organization were given with achieving

education along with seven other significant goals by 2015. It is widely agreed that the decade of 1990 was one of diminishing progress. Even though there was a lot of spontaneity going on, it was noted that the globe; particularly the third world nations, were not able to meet its previous goals because of its sluggish progress. The process of reaching the goals was regularly deteriorating as it was rather speeding.

MDGs have 18 targets and 48 indicators and there were one or more indicators and targets set for each MDG, but the following eight MDGs that were set to assess the global development pace: Putting an end to hunger and extreme poverty: The hunger component of the first Millennium Development Goal (MDG) aims to reduce the proportion of people who suffer from hunger by half between 1990 and 2015. (Fanzo et al., 2011). Achievement of universal primary education: The second goal of MDGs further covers the areas: Net primary enrollment, survival rate of primary education, literacy rate of youth aged 15-24.

Promotion of gender equality and empower women: (Target: eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015). Girls' education, at least in the form it takes across much of the world, is not an unqualified social good. Education produces social, economic and cultural change (Ansell, 2017).

 Reduction of child mortality & improvement of maternal health: MDG 4 & 5, "Reduce child mortality", has a target of reducing the under-five mortality rate by two-thirds. MDG-5, "Improve maternal health", has a target of reducing the maternal mortality ratio by three-quarters. Despite important limitations, the MDGs have galvanized and focused global attention and monitoring. MDGs 4 and 5 are important for global health as a whole, because they represent the mortality endpoints for women and children across specific diseases, nutritional and environmental risk factors, and more distal determinants including inequalities in economic resources and education (Bryce et al., 2013).

Combating HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases: Goal 6 had three targets. Target 6A: to stop the spread of HIV/AIDS by the year 2015, target 6B: world-wide medical care for HIV/AIDS for everybody who are in need of such treatment, and target 6C: to stop the frequency of malaria and other diseases by 2010 (Edwin, 2023).

Ensuring of environmental sustainability: The goal 7 has four targets, Target 7A: to integrate the principles of sustainable development into every nation's policies and programme, and also reverse the depletion of environmental resources. Target 7B: to reduce biodiversity loss and achieve a substantial reduction in the rate of loss by 2010. Target 7C: to halve the proportion of the universal population without sustainable access to clean and safe drinking water and basic sanitation by 2015. Target 7D: to achieve substantial improvement in the lives of a minimum of 100 million slum dwellers by 2020.

Development of a Global Partnership for Development: The MDGs played an epistemic role, providing a cognitive reference point for a wide range of stakeholders to organize the collaboration, the actions and the data in relation to the commonly agreed goals and targets. They played a motivational role focusing and incentivizing cooperation (Larionova, 2020).

Millennium Development Goals and Education

Universal primary education is the second and most important goal of Millennium development goal, as the education is back bone of any developed

society. Education is considered a right of every child without differentiation of race, sex, region and religion. Education plays very important role in the development of a child's personality. It is also considered that education is vital for nation development and there is a strong correlation between education and economic development of a country. It (Education) plays a critical role in building human capabilities and accelerates economic growth through knowledge, skill and creative strength of a society (Pakistan Economic Survey 2007-08).

Children are the future human resource, and education determines every culture. The foundation for socioeconomic progress is provided by education. Poor educational systems might be a major factor in underdeveloped nations' failure to advance (Memon, 2007). Because reading stimulates children's cognitive, emotional, and social development and legitimizes children and youth, education for youngsters which has immeasurable importance. A youngster with more education would do better in life (SPARC, 2006; Islamabad). Everyone has the right to education, according to article 26(1) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations). Primary education is the main emphasis of the Universal Primary Education (UPE), which is Millennium Development Goal 2. Additionally, Target 2A makes a commitment that by 2015, all kids' boys and girls will be able to register in elementary schools.

The global movement education for all (EFA) goals adopted at the world education forum 2000 in Dakar is representative of global commitment towards the development towards the universal, quality and equitable education for all children. The EFA policy in Pakistan has resulted in gradual increase in enrollment and completion rates at the primary level; however, there have been lower achievements than targeted by the policy. The low achievement of the targets is because of not overcoming the basic problems historically prevalent in Pakistan. Policy cannot succeed until it is grounded in the context and addresses the basic problems of poverty, lack of infrastructure, lack of appropriate funds, poor governance, and cultural or social barriers to girls' education (Chang, 2012).

The leaders of the world held the opinion that without access to education, it is impossible to generate competent human resources for the future. The success and prosperity of every nation are greatly influenced by education, especially high-quality education. It was determined to put more emphasis on early childhood education and to provide free, mandatory, and high-quality education in order to advance education. Additionally, it was anticipated that by 2015, the adult literacy rate will have grown by 50%. They thought that between 1990 and 2000, significant progress had been made towards UPE, notably in the third-world nations. Numerous middle-income nations, including Chile, China, Cuba, the Republic of Korea, Singapore, Sri Lanka, etc., have attained UPE while still in the early stages of development, much like today's impoverished nations (Sadrudin, 2013). These nations have created a system of education where basic education is given major emphasis. Many of the world's poorest nations have robust and long-lasting basic education systems. Ethiopia, Guinea, Mozambique, and other nations were also among them (Sadrudin, 2013). All of these nations have improved their survival rates by emphasizing education.

Universalization of primary education remains a major objective of all the government of Pakistan since its inception. For achieving Universalization of primary education, the committee of the primary and secondary education (1947) considered it is essential that a national system of education should be based on

the strong foundations of free and compulsory primary education. But according to UNICEF report 2022 Pakistan has the second highest percentage of out of school children that is 44% of total population of this group age.

Education is reflected as a key change agent for a nation and country. It is education which opens the windows of freedom for individuals who ultimately play his/her role for his country as well as for the whole world. Pakistan is one of the countries which remain failed in universalization of primary education. According to UNICEF's 2022 report, Pakistan has the second-highest percentage of illiterate children in the world, about half of school going aged children are out of school. With this in mind, the researcher will attempt to analyse the successes and failures in achieving universal primary education.

Objectives of Study

1. To analyses the five year students' enrollment status of primary education in Pakistan.
2. To find out the public, private and other public sectors enrollment ratio at primary level.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In world, several studies had been brought out to recognize the MDGs. It is resulted of some publications. Many countries have implemented various techniques and strategies, and various objectives and indicators. This chapter highlights the contribution of different scholars around the world. A lot of studies had defined the role of MDGs in different countries. Some important studies are reviewed in this chapter.

Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)

The eight Millennium Development Goals are targets that world leaders have pledged to work towards achieving in a set amount of time. These objectives, which have a number of targets and indicators, are intended to combat male dominance, poverty, hunger, sickness, and illiteracy. The MDGs have proven to be a very effective instrument for communication because they harness the power of numbers to clarify difficult ideas like poverty and give ethereal objectives like dignity and freedom a concrete form, and transform universal goals into locally rooted difficulties. Without such a tool, international development would not have undergone a normative change (Fukuda-Parr, 2011). The MDGs were created as "Human Development meets Results-Based Management," according to (Hulme, 2010), which describes the new agreement on poverty as first emulating the HDCA's forceful direction. This could explain how the MDGs were conceptualized, but not how they were implemented.

Juan Somavia, a longtime observer of UN summits, came up with the concept for the World Summit on Social Development. According to Schechter Somavia was successful in bringing authenticity to a meeting that was intended as a sort of building of all that came before it. Its design was based on three pillars: employment, social integration, and poverty alleviation (Schechter & Somavia, 2005). The strategic realists, who don't see the MDGs as a blueprint for action but see them as essential to sweeping aspiration and circulating political commitment and public support (Fukuda-Parr, 2008); and the critics, who see them as well-intentioned but poorly thought through.

Following the narrowing of the agenda from Education for All to universal primary education, from gender equality and concerns with participation and sustainability to a limited notion of gender parity, (Unterhalter, 2013) has taken on the design of some of the history of how the education targets and indicators in the MDG framework were chosen.

According to Mr. Ban, the Millennium Development Goals have been the most successful global anti-poverty initiative in history. "The MDGs have demonstrated that focused global improvement goals can make a significant difference." As a result of the UN Millennium Summit in 2000, all nations adopted the eight objectives (Ki-Moon, 2013). The MDGs outlined an ambitious plan for ending poverty and enhancing human life. They are occasionally seen as a bureaucratic exercise with little practical application, with advancements in development outcomes viewed more as a result of supporting economic growth than as the result of targeted policy initiatives (Larionova, 2020).

Authors argue the reasons for delaying or small range of development in attaining the MDGs are complicate, and with worldwide decline and a basic argument against any MDG is that any flaw in the framework itself cannot account for all development shortcomings (Fehling, et al., 2013). The second method involves comparing the rates of advancement for each indicator between the pre- and post-MDG eras in order to determine if the MDGs were successful. Fukuda-Parr, Greenstein, and Stewart (2013) advocate this strategy, which views the MDGs as performance standards. Based on this methodology, 13 of the 24 indicators qualified for enhanced development in the post-2000 period for 50% or more of the nations, and 19 of the 25 indicators qualified for overall development for 50% or more of the LDCs (Fukuda-Parr et al., 2013).

How to gauge the MDGs' development has been a topic of heated discussion in both academic and policy circles. The MDGs' original intent—that they be global objectives rather than country-specific targets—remains intact (Vandemoortele, 2014). The outcomes of the initial MDG process need to inspire humility. The MDGs have been an effective tool for structuring discussions and giving finders a plan of action. However, broad-based development is a difficult, protracted project. There is just so much an accusation can accomplish, no matter how high-level the conference that approves it may be (Kenny & Sumner, 2011). Asadullah, Savoia, and Sen discovered that social indicators steadily improved over the MDG era, providing evidence of South Asia's convergence with richer countries in many crucial outcomes (Asadullah et al., 2020).

In the UN's narrative of development association and its subsequent commitment with the Bretton Woods institutions, WTO, national parliaments, civil society, and the private sector in pursuit of inclusive and sustainable economic development, the MDGs and the Monterrey Consensus introduced a new element (Larionova, 2020). The discursive influence of MDG terminology, as emphasized by Miller Dawkins (2014) and Fukuda-Parr (2010), is illustrated via a study of the plans. The accomplishment of MDG objectives has traditionally been included in Indonesia's national programmes, but no national standards have been established using international standards as a guide. The execution on the ground was not directly related to the national plans in and of themselves.

It is exceedingly unlikely that Pakistan would achieve UPE by 2015 when statistics on budget allocation, enrollment, literacy rates, and gender and geographic disparity in literacy are taken into account. With the rapid

advancement of science and technology and the creation of the information economy, it is not clear how a society could prosper with illiteracy rates of 50% and a subpar education system (Zakar et al, 2013). The MDGs can be accomplished and momentum built for an ambitious and motivating post-2015 development framework, according to Mr. Ban. The time is now to intensify our efforts to create a more equitable, safe, and sustainable future for everyone (Ki-Moon, 2013).

The MDGs' creation as universally accepted objectives ignored specific national and regional needs and left out a number of significant development challenges, such weak governance. Additionally, the majority of national aggregated statistics used to gauge success obfuscates within-country differences and preclude a clear knowledge of regional growth. In place of precise end goals, which are challenging to achieve for certain nations, new approaches are currently being created to gauge the "pace of progress" (Fukuda-Parr et al., 2013).

By aligning many of its programme with these global goals, the Vietnamese government has ensured strong political support for the MDGs. Vietnam has also converted the MDGs into "actionable" Vietnam Development Goals to better suit the nation's unique political and socioeconomic circumstances as a means of claiming "ownership" of the MDGs (Van et al. 2016).

Escobar (1995) and Lawson (2015)'s claims that the MDGs were not designed to achieve true and genuine progress in impoverished nations are supported by Durokifa and Ijeoma's (2018) analysis. The MDGs actually had more to do with the West's commercial expansion as well as its use of force and dominance over Third World nations.

METHODOLOGY

The goal of the current study is to evaluate Pakistan's success in achieving the MDG of universal primary education. This study was descriptive in nature. The case study research design was adopted. Clear research is notable as document review method. By using document method researcher collected required data through checklist that has the indicators to measure universal primary education set by United Nations. Quantitative data for this study was gained from Pakistan Education Statistics. This quantitative data was used to access this study. Pakistan has 230,921,254 populations; ranking fifth country of this planet has 2.89% of world population in space of 881,913 square kilometers. Population of school going children (age 6-15) 22.43% of total population and 22.8 million children (age 6-15) are out of school and this is the 44% of this group age. The sample of this study was children of Pakistan(includes AJK & GB) aged 5-16 According to UN department of Economics and Social Affairs Pakistan has 51,795,637 children age 5 to 16 that is 22.43% of total population and according to UNICEF 22,800,000 children are out of school in Pakistan.

Secondary data was used in this research study. The researcher used checklist (which has the indicators to measure the universal primary education) as a research tool for data collection.

Objectives and satisfactory answers of research questions was found through document review inspecting different documents of Pakistan Education Statistics from the time period 2016-2021. Pakistan Education Statistics serve as the primary data source. This study is based on secondary data that was gathered from the AEPAM website (Academy of Educational Planning & Management) library. Time series data have been taken from the period 2016-2021.

DATA ANALYSIS

Table 1 performance of MDG2

Indicators	National value	Target	Status
Net primary enrollment proportion %	57.00	100	Off track
Completion of primary education (grade 1-5)	50.00	100	Off track
Literacy ratio	58.00	88	Off track

Pakistan MDGs report 2015

Interpretation: The above Table 1 indicates that Pakistan could not achieve the Millenum Development Goal 2 that is universal primary education. Despite the fact that Constitution of Pakistan article 25(A) requires the state to provide educations to the children from 5 to 16 years of age a free education. Despite of article 25(A) and MDG-2 the enrollment has not been completed yet. Lower enrollment rate and high dropout rate show poor condition of primary education in Pakistan. Plenty of children are enroll but they could not complete primary education. And low literacy rate also show a large number of youth aged 16-24 could not read, write and speak effectively.

Table 2 Gender wise primary enrollment in Pakistan

	Gender of School	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Student enrolment	Male	1943735.95	2828695.656	316257.789
	Female	1555435.68	2330371.423	260543.446

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: The descriptive table 4.2 displays the sample size, mean, standard deviation and standard error for both gender groups. The standard deviation indicates how far the data deviates from the mean, whereas the mean displays the average number of students enrolled for each gender. The sample mean's standard error of the mean illustrates how far it may deviate from the actual population mean. There are 1943736 male students enrolled on average, with a standard deviation of 2828696 and a mean standard error of 316257.8. The average number of female students enrolled is 1555436, with a standard deviation of 2330371 and a mean standard error of 260543.45. The less number of female students as compare to male students shows the slightly gender disparity at primary level in Pakistan.

Table 3 Pre primary & primary enrollment in Pakistan

	Stages of Education	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Student enrolment	Pre primary	992414.49	1495808.353	89391.647
	Primary	2054999.34	3205603.736	191914.476

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: The descriptive table 3 displays the sample size, mean, standard deviation and standard mean error. The above table shows that the mean

enrollment for primary students is higher than the mean enrollment for pre-primary students. Additionally, primary students' standard deviation and standard error of the mean are both higher than those of pre-primary children which suggest that there is more variability in the enrollment data for primary students. The above calculation shows the magnitude of difference between the stages of education (primary and pre primary). The primary students enrollment is twice that of pre primary. The student enrollment at primary level is twice when compare to the pre primary level.

Table 4 Primary enrollment in Pakistan by location

	Location of School	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Student enrolment	Urban	1206582.20	1688309.528	188758.744
	Rural	2356800.45	3487051.437	389864.203

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: The descriptive table 4 displays the sample size, mean, standard deviation and standard mean error. The above table calculated the group statistics for student enrollment, location-wise, for both the Urban and Rural groups. The sample size (N) for both groups is 80, which is the number of enrollment observations in each group. The mean enrollment for the Urban group is 1,206,582.52, while the mean enrollment for the Rural group is 2,356,800.45. This suggests that, on average, there are more students enrolled in the Rural group than the Urban group. The above table also shows that the rural enrollment is more spread out than urban enrollment. This also indicates that the rural enrollment more vary from the true urban population. It also shows that the urban population is nearly twice of rural population.

Table 5 Primary enrollment in Pakistan by provinces

Provinces	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval for Mean Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Punjab	3157562.49	2065904.803	246922.852	2664964.87	3650160.10
Sindh	1264334.44	750902.892	89750.062	1085287.97	1443380.92
KP	1137621.89	922326.208	110239.067	917700.96	1357542.81
Baluchistan	201156.43	142508.387	17033.010	167176.50	235136.35
AJK	170880.86	104672.329	12510.736	145922.62	195839.09
GB	44616.83	30409.966	3660.930	37311.55	51922.10
ICT	68084.81	46247.061	5527.581	57057.59	79112.04
Pakistan	6116677.84	3836836.81	458589.713	5201816.40	7031539.29
Total	1522756.48	2553630.75	108007.072	1310606.35	1734906.62

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: The descriptive table 5 displays the sample size, mean,

standard deviation, standard mean error and 95% confidence interval for mean. The higher standard deviation shows there is more variation in the enrollment numbers of Punjab as compared to other provinces. A higher standard deviation indicates that there is more variation in the enrollment numbers, a lower standard deviation, however, suggests that enrollment figures are more closely distributed around the mean. In this instance it seems that Punjab has a much higher standard deviation than other provinces, which suggests that there is more variation in the enrollment numbers of Punjab. There may be a variety of causes for this, including variations in educational standards, availability of schools, or other demographic factors. According the Pakistan wikipedia Punjab is most populous province of Pakistan has population 110 million in 2021, Sindh has 47.9 million population, KPK has 35 million population, Baluchistan has 12.34 population, AJK has 4 million population, GB has 1.5 million population and ICT has 1.1 million population. In the light of above information the table shows the highest enrollment in ICT and Punjab province the largest province of Pakistan by population has lowest enrollment at primary level among all the provinces of Pakistan.

Table 6 Primary enrollment in Pakistan by provinces ANOVA

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between Groups	2228503399121676.00	7	318357628445953.70	124.387	.000
Within Groups	1410231333269177.00	551	2559403508655.494		
Total	3638734732390853.00	558			

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: Table 6 shows the significance difference between the province of Pakistan. In above table there is a statistically significant variation in enrolment rates across the various Pakistani provinces. The higher F-value indicates a larger difference between the groups. The significance value is .000 which is below the 0.05 and therefore there is statistically significance difference in the mean of enrollment at primary level in different provinces of Pakistan.

Table 7 School Status Wise Enrollment of Primary Education
Descriptive

	School Status		Statistic	Std. Error
Student enrolment	**All**	**Mean**	**1765638.57**	**150298.713**
		Interquartile Range	2225533	
		Skewness	2.254	.136
		Kurtosis	5.222	.272
	Public	Mean	2066216.99	354165.829
		Interquartile Range	2487386	
		Skewness	2.202	.269
		Kurtosis	4.495	.532
	Other public	Mean	45696.47	10249.646
		Interquartile Range	36905	

DIALOGUE SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW

	Skewness	3.223	.271
	Kurtosis	11.989	.535
	Mean	1466364.40	226516.225
Private	Interquartile Range	2308856	
	Skewness	1.559	.269
	Kurtosis	1.404	.532

Interpretation: Table 7 provides a descriptive summary of student enrollment for each school status category. This table shows that the enrollment of public, private and other private sectors is slightly to the right. However the skewness values are relatively small which show that the distribution is only slightly skewed. The data is relatively symmetric and does not deviate much from a normal distribution. And the positive value of kurtosis indicates that the distribution of enrollment is more peaked than normal. The mean students enrollment at primary level of public sector is 2066216.99, for other public sector is 45696.47 and for private sector it is 1466364.40. if we add these mean values together the result is 3578277.86, now we have total value so we easily find out the percentage of students enrollment at each sector. These show that in public sectors 57.74% of students enrollment rate at primary level, 1.2% in other public sector and 40.97 in private sectors.

Table 8 Survival rate (School survival rate Descriptive)

Years	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval for Mean	
				Lower Bound	Upper Bound
2016-17	73.56	19.839	4.960	62.99	84.13
2017-18	66.81	19.614	4.903	56.36	77.26
2018-19	71.88	7.446	1.862	67.91	75.84
2019-20	72.94	6.728	1.682	69.35	76.52
2020-21	74.81	8.627	2.157	70.22	79.41
Total	72.00	13.739	1.536	68.94	75.06

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: The table 8 shows the mean of survival rate of 5 years annually from 2016-17 to 2020-21. it also represents that the survival rate of 2020-21 is higher than rest of 4 years that is 74.81 and is tightly clustered around the mean.

This is also show the dropout rate at primary level. The average SR of 5 years (2016-21) is 72 which indicate that there are 28% students can not complete primary education. The students who dropped have faced many problems and challenges, like financial problems, lake of concentration of illiterate and ignorant parents, cultural hindrance or school distance.

Table 9 Survival rate School survival rate (ANOVA)

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between Groups	610.500	4	152.625	.800	.529
Within Groups	14301.500	75	190.687		
Total	14912.000	79			

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics

Interpretation: Table 9 shows the difference in five year survival rate at primary level in Pakistan. The significant value that is .529 shows the group means differences are not statistically significant, because it is greater than.05, indicating that there are no significant differences in the survival rates of the various years.

Conclusion

The key findings lead to several conclusions regarding universal primary education.

1) Based on finding it can concluded that public sector has failed in achieving universal primary education as during recent years 2019-21 the enrollment decreased in public sector and increase in private sector that means parents prefer to enroll their children in private sector.

2) Based on finding it can concluded that above 40% the students are enrolled in private sector that shows the people are forced to buy education from the private sector according to their social status. This create a class system of education that is an obstacle to achieving Millennium Development Goal 2 as more than 60% of population in Pakistan lives below the poverty line.

3) Based on finding it can concluded that there is no better concept of pre primary education in the public sector, in private sector there is system of pre primary education, but in every private institution this system depending on the social status.

4) Based on finding it can concluded that the distribution of student enrollment within each gender group. There is higher male enrollment ratio as compare to female enrollment. In Pakistan 28.8 millions school going children are not enrolled (UNICEF, 2022) where the out of school female children has alarming situation. That also shows the gender discrimination in Pakistan.

5) Based on finding it can concluded that in Pakistan 28% students could not complete their primary schooling because of several reasons like poverty, child labour, gender discrimination, long distance schools and ignorance of parents and all of these problems are due to negligence of policy makers and stake holders.

6) Based on finding it can concluded that there is difference between province wise enrollment at primary education. Punjab is most populous province of Pakistan and a large number of children are out of school and Islamabad Capital Territory has highest enrollment rate at primary level.

Recommendations

On the based of findings of study following recommendations have been suggested:

1) It is recommended that the strategies to enhance enrollment like seminars, workshops, theater, stage dramas should be held by education ministry, and local education department to provide awareness of education every where

especially at tribal areas and also regulate all non functional and closed school to achieve maximum enrollment.

2) The government should take all private schools its own custody to discourage the business in education and all the children of the society have one level of education ignoring the discrimination of class. Otherwise we will not be able to achieve the true education and peaceful society.

3) Government should set incentives for poor parents so that the children can continue their schooling.

4) Government should focus on pre primary education because without readiness for primary education the student, teacher and parents all of them face many complication in completing a student's primary education.

5) The policy makers should make people friendly education policy for Pakistani society create now and apply tomorrow, after 10 year this society will get prosperity peace and happy life.

6) Government should also involve the Deene Madaris (religious institutions) to enhace enrollment at primary level by introducing modern education in Madaris (religious institutions). In majority of Deene Madaris (religious institutions) of Pakistan there is no concept of education as modern contemporary education they memories Quranic verses in Arabic and some other Tafaseer by religious teachers. They do not know where they live, because of this reason different terrorist organization and groups use them because they are innocent they don't have any awareness so, it should need to be changed because our religion Islam is very peaceful religion it is not the manifesto of terrorism.

REFERENCES

Ansell, N. (2017). Achieving gender parity in education: Achievements and limitations of Millennium Development Goal 3. *Laboring and learning*, 111-130.

Asadullah, M. N., Savoia, A., & Sen, K. (2020). Will South Asia achieve the sustainable development goals by 2030? Learning from the MDGs experience. *Social Indicators Research*, *152*, 165-189.

Bryce, J., Black, R. E., & Victora, C. G. (2013). Millennium Development Goals 4 and 5: progress and challenges. *BMC medicine*, *11*, 1-4.

Chang, F. H. (2012). The Effectiveness of Policy and Practice for "Universal Primary Education" Within Education for All: Case Study Of Pakistan. In *Learning and Doing Policy Analysis in Education* (pp. 41-60). Brill.

Durokifa, A. A., & Ijeoma, E. C. (2018). Neo-colonialism and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in Africa: A blend of an old wine in a new bottle. *African Journal of Science, Technology, Innovation and Development*, *10*(3), 355-366.

Edwin, E. I. (2023). Appraisal of the impacts of human resource management on millennium development goal 6 in Abia state, Nigeria (2000-2015). *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review (Oman Chapter)*, *11*(1), 5-10.

Fanzo, J. C., & Pronyk, P. M. (2011). A review of global progress toward the Millennium Development Goal 1 Hunger Target. *Food and Nutrition Bulletin*, *32*(2), 144-158.

Fehling, M., Nelson, B. D., & Venkatapuram, S. (2013). Limitations of the

DIALOGUE SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW

Millennium Development Goals: a literature review. *Global public health*, *8*(10), 1109-1122.

Fukuda-Parr, S., Greenstein, J., & Stewart, D. (2013). How should MDG success and failure bejudged: Faster progress or achieving the targets?World Development,41,19–30.

Fukuda-Parr, S., Greenstein, J., & Stewart, D. (2013). How should MDG success and failure be judged: Faster progress or achieving the targets?. *World Development*, *41*, 19-30.

Hulme, D. (2010). Lessons from the making of the MDGS: human development meets results-based management in an unfair world. *IDS bulletin*, *41*(1), 15-25.

Ki-Moon, B. (2013). The millennium development goals report 2013. *United Nations Pubns*, *365*, 366.

Larionova, M. (2020). The challenges of attaining the millennium development goals (MDGs). *International Organisations Research Journal*, *15*(1), 155-176.

Larionova, M. (2020). The challenges of attaining the millennium development goals (MDGs). *International Organisations Research Journal*, *15*(1), 155-176.

Memon, G. R. (2007). Education in Pakistan: The key issues, problems and the new challenges. *Journal of management and social sciences,* 3(1), 47-55.

Sadruddin, M. M. (2013). Millennium Development Goals: are we really achieving universal primary education. *Dialogue*, *8*(1), 53-67.

Shaukat, U., Javaid, U., & Majeed, G. (2017). The Second Millennium Development Goal in Pakistan: Targets, Results and Challenges. Pakistan Vision, 18(2), 179-192.

Unterhalter, E. (2013). Education targets, indicators and a post-2015 development agenda: Education for All, the MDGs, and human development. *Cambridge, MA: School of Public Health, Harvard University*.

Van Minh, H., Oh, J., Hoat, L. N., Lee, J. K., & Williams, J. S. (2016). Millennium development goals in Vietnam: Taking multi-sectoral action to improve health and address the social determinants. *Global Health Action*, *9*(1), 31271.

Vandemoortele, J. (2014). Post-2015 agenda: mission impossible?. *Development Studies Research. An Open Access Journal*, *1*(1), 223-232.

Zakar, P. D. M. Z., Qureshi, D. S., Ullah, D. R., Zakar, D. R., Aqil, N., & Manawar, D. R. (2020). Universal Primary Education in Pakistan: constraints and challenges. *South Asian Studies*, *28*(2).